

**Minutes from Quarterly CRE Meeting
March 13, 2014
Concierge Conference Centers
New York, NY**



Members in Attendance: Brad Adgate, Laura Cowan, Paul Donato, Janice Finkel-Greene, Ed Gaffney, Nancy Gallagher, Hadassa Gerber, Tanya Giles, Jeffrey Graham, Mark Kaline, Pat Liquori, Billy McDowell, Michael Nathanson, Beth Rockwood, Bryon Schafer, Ceril Shagrin, Stacey Shulman, Ira Sussman, Emily Vanides, Judy Vogel, , Tom Ziangas, , Janet Gallent,

Present by Phone: Cheryl Brink, Joanne Burns, George Ivie, Dan Murphy, Keenan Pendergrass, Robin Thomas, Sharon Warden

Absent: Artie Bulgrin, Michele Buslik, Jed Meyer, David Poltrack, Jack Wakshlag,

Also Attending: Tom Campo, Lynda Clarizio, Shelley Drasal, Michael Link, Horst Stipp, Susan Whiting, Richard Zackon

Opening

Ceril Shagrin called the meeting to order at 1:02 pm.

Steering Committee

Pat reported that the Steering committee considered membership for Susie Thomas of Universal McCann, a review of the facilitator and the number of seats that a member could hold and the relationship between committees and projects.

Ceril asked for a report on the meeting with the Nielsen Audio (Radio) Clients on March 6, 2014. Richard reported out that there were 11 radio representatives at the meeting who were interested in the work and possibly joining the CRE. Regarding research, the group felt radio representation across various CRE committees would be preferable than a single radio committee. It appeared that many of the issues in radio mirrored the issues in local TV (diaries and their sample sizes). Regarding membership, it was left up to the attendees to apply individually for membership. Ceril reported it was a very positive meeting and the radio community was eager to get involved with the CRE.

Finances

Michael Nathanson reported that in 2014, we spent \$2.7 million, \$2.3 million for project expenses and \$400,000 for admin. We came in a little under budget.

He also reported a meeting with Ira Sussman, Tim Drodz, Ceril Shagrin, Richard Zackon, and himself regarding slow payment to vendors. Nielsen assured the CRE that it takes the issue seriously. The CRE will be more aggressive in the future to assure payment. Michael, with Ira present, made the assumption that the CRE will have \$3 million again in 2014. Richard noted that we have already committed \$760,000 to research in 2014.

Richard suggested that if committees have projects to fund in 2014, it would be good to make that request by the June meeting.

Guest Appearance, Susan Whiting

Ceril expressed the sentiments of the CRE and declared the group's excitement and sense of privilege to have Susan attend the meeting. She thanked Susan for her support of the council's work since its founding.

Susan began by reminiscing about her conversation with Dave Thomas of Nielsen discussing this radical idea of a research think-tank that Nielsen funded but is client driven. She said the results have been beyond what was expected. She added that it is a wonderful thing to see a group of smart people who often compete in the market place able to get together to further understand consumer behavior. The accomplishments of the CRE are really impressive and terrific. Susan thanked the CRE for its contribution to Dennison College and said she was speechless when she received the note and could not think of a nicer thing that the CRE could have done.

Big Data

Stacey thanked members for attending the Big Data event in February and acknowledged Richard and the committee for bringing it together. It included traditional researchers and data science experts. Paul Donato said it was a valuable experience for him ranging from AAPOR to NYU and IBM data science. Paul, himself is closely involved with integrating structured and unstructured data. He went on to say that in the future, data science becomes transparent and is about the user interface. That is why Nielsen is working with IBM. Stacey said that the committee is looking forward to another Big Data event, probably at the end of May focused on case studies. Stacey noted that there is a huge spectrum of understanding around Big Data and the role of the committee is a lot about education. Richard notes in the future, we will put out emails to members regarding upcoming meetings, which may be of particular interest.

One member suggested at our Big Data events, that we emphasize the responsibility of researchers to avoid bad data. Michael Link and Mark Kaline chimed in about their concerns regarding bad data. Bryon Schafer spoke about the need to add IT to research teams. Janice Finkel-Greene commented that when it comes to data quality, big does not trump good. Horst noted concerns that he had heard from ARF members about data scientists being integrated into research departments.

Social Media

Beth Rockwood noted the March 6, 2014 webinar reporting out the initial findings of the Social media study with Keller Fay. She said the committee is considering a second webinar with additional findings if there is interest. They are planning a presentation from the academic team on April 8, 2014, if anyone wishes to attend. The academics are modeling how social media relates to actual viewing. She also stated that she would be giving a short presentation on the study at the ARF on March 24. She said Shelley is working on a date with the Time Life Building to share out the full results.

Moving forward, the group will focus will be more on social media, TV, and advertising. In addition, Jeffrey Graham will be sharing research he has conducted at Twitter.

Digital

Bryon Schafer shared an early look at the GFK ethnography looking at viewing of video by device. GFK has a panel of 100 household across eight markets with strong representation across ages and ethnicity. Bryon shared data about device ownership and video subscription.

GFK has created a novel digital tool kit to capture ancillary information through ongoing correspondence with panelists. The study will extend over a two-year period. The researchers have been impressed with the sophistication of the participants, even the children.

Jeffrey Graham questioned how GFK was defining dominant screen. Bryon said it is the screen where people are spending most of their time. Lynda Clarizio expressed interest in how people are using PCs.

Media Consumption and Engagement

Laura Cowan reported the committee is hard at work on multiple projects. She advised the council that on April 23rd, there would be a webinar regarding use of mobile as a measurement tool. She promised to email to council members a cross-platform metrics spreadsheet.

Laura requested funding from the council for the next phase of cross-platform impression alignment, a white paper laying out a research agenda. Specifically, she requested \$75,000 for Horowitz Associates to produce a literal review, conduct interviews, and produce a white paper summarizing the issues. Paul Donato asked whether this means we are moving toward impressions based measurement. Richard reminded the council that it was Michael Link who, a year earlier had identified the issue of alignment of impressions across platform as a priority. Emily Vanides commented that the cross-platform measurement was the top issue in the client survey. Lynda Clarizio asked how the research would be conducted. Laura responded that Horowitz would conduct 30 interviews with industry executives on both the buy and sell side. Laura alerted the council that she might be requesting an additional \$30,000 in June for a survey of 200 executives. Lynda advised the committee to focus on the measurement perspective or it will just likely hear a variety of opinions. Stacey Shulman noted that TVB is exploring the area of impressions based currency. Horst advised getting interviewee feedback on concrete solutions. Pat Liguori questioned whether 30 interviews would be enough and suggested the committee seek more funds for perhaps 50 interviews. Laura responded that the intent was qualitative and directional. Janice Finkel-Greene declared it necessary to learn how the metrics are being applied. Nancy Gallagher echoed the advantage of beginning with 30 interviews and coming back subsequently. Bryon Schafer suggested reaching out to individual experts in small groups perhaps over a meal. The proposal for \$75,000 for a white paper was passed with a single opposing vote.

Laura reported on GFK's progress on the acceleration ethnography. The study is designed to understand what the early majority rather than the early adopters will look like. Smart TV's were the dominant purchase. The data gathering should be completed by the end of April.

Horst Stipp expressed a concern that the study would be misinterpreted as a quantitative study.

A word from Nielsen

Lynda Clarizo confirmed that \$3 million was approved for CRE for 2014. She appreciated the great work of the council and assessed it as critical as to what is happening with the future of Nielsen's product development. Nielsen needs to be aware of the consumer trends that the CRE is finding.

She discussed some management changes at Nielsen. Mitch Barns is currently the new CEO. Mitchell Habid will be leaving as Nielsen's COO to be replaced by Brian West, longtime Nielsen CFO. She also mentioned Katie Burke had been named EVP of Marketing and Communications.

In response to a question about what she learned since joining Nielsen, Lynda has been surprised at the sophistication of clients regarding media consumption and measurement. She also said she has been impressed with client willingness to drive change all around and she has come to appreciate how hard that change is; it is a constant balance. Lynda suggested more participation from the product team at Nielsen with the CRE.

ROI

Dave Poltrack was unable to attend so Beth Rockwood proposed a project for the committee. It was a proposal from Sequent Partners to build on its initial study of Marketing Mix Modeling looking at long-term branding effect of advertising and improving the data inputs for television. The branding study will be a four-month project for \$125,000 and the TV data study is a three-month project for \$95,000. The committee seeks approval for a total amount of \$220,000. Documentation was provided. Ira asked whether the interviews would likely lead to good collaboration and Beth replied that Sequent had good corporation in the first round. Horst Stipp expressed concern that the study not appear bias in favor of television. Lynda Clarizio replied that all media need to be looked at holistically. Beth acknowledged that the proposal is focused on television. Lynda noted that there are many requests from Nielsen's audio clients to look at that medium which is not a reason not to do the study. Ceril commented the least reliable input measurements come from diary only markets. It was questioned whether the study would look at television or video on all its platforms. Questions also arose regarding the price. Michael Nathanson expressed concern with a process where a second stage is contingent upon the first. Paul Donato mentioned that Nielsen is working on unstructured data with IBM and it might be useful to include that work within the ROI research program. The date of the release is uncertain. Ceril suggested taking the proposal back to Dave Poltrack and requesting that non-TV video and radio be included. Nancy Gallagher proposed a conference call with Sequent Partners so that members can get clarification followed by an email vote.

Return Path Data

Richard asked Pat Liguori if they might provide CRE with the summary of what we have learned in the past few years about Return Path Data. Pat replied that the Return Path committee plans to meet with Nielsen to discuss that. Ed Gaffney asked whether Kantar have been included in discussion. Pat replied that the committee had met with them however; the sense was it more of a pitch than a learning session. Ed added that his company might have new data to show. Tom Ziangas asked whether Pat's committee had been in touch with ESPN on project blueprint. Pat said that she could call Artie Bulgrin to see what they are willing to share. Bryon Schafer mentioned that Comcast has some new boxes. Pat was mindful of not interfering with MRC work but said she would check it out.

George Ivie spoke to the issue of VOD measurement. Pat agreed that VOD is increasingly important and would be willing to suggest as a focus of the committee.

Commercial Pod

Hadassa Gerber thanked all of the people who have worked on the efforts but concluded that there was not adequate support at this time for this project. She suggested that it be moved to the group looking at cross platform commercial platforms. Richard acknowledged the work including some proposals, which were submitted.

Sample Quality

Sample Quality work was reported out under Insights to Practice, but Ceril reported that the committee finished its work on improving rates among Asian Americans. At this point, the committee is not asking for additional funds for a second phase unless Nielsen is looking to apply it beyond code reader.

Local Measurement

Billy McDowell said his committee continues to look at options within the diary only markets, which might use data and modeling to provide greater stability in the data.

Communications

Emily Vanides reported that we are now up to 635 subscribers to our newsletter, a 59% increase over the past year. She also reported that we have increased the frequency of the newsletter to monthly, shorter articles, timely snackable to read. There has also been significant increase in website traffic. Both of these increases appear due to recent events. Tom Campo gave examples of recent press coverage. Shelley Drasal, our Coordinator spoke to a possible overhaul of our website. We have found the files are disorganized some links are broken. Richard also notes that there had been a security breach with is prompting the change and the overhaul would reduce the likely hood of another. Emily has received a quote and is requesting \$15000 to get the sight functional and looking good. A concern was expressed about the amount being sufficient. Joanne Burns, who had originally recommended Wireframe said they do good, efficient, inexpensive work. Shelley assured \$15,000 was sufficient unless more bells and whistles are requested. Emily asked to bring the motion to a vote. The motion carried without objection. Emily invited CRE members to join the work of the committee.

Poynter Institute Event

Richard reported that in January, an event was held on the Future of News Audiences for which the CRE had contributed funding along with the MacArthur Foundation. Attending the event for the CRE is Billy McDowell, Keenan Pendergrass Beth Rockwood, Ceril Shagrin, Stacey Shulman, Jack Wakshlag, and Richard Zackon. Billy reported it was a good day of discussion and inspired action within his company. Stacey Shulman asked whether there would be proceedings from the event and Richard said he would inquire.

Insights to Practice

Nancy Gallagher reported that earlier in the day Insights to Practice reviewed the finding of the Local and Sample Quality studies. She requested more participation from Nielsen regarding

CRE projects, possibly Webinars just for Nielsen staff. Lynda Clarizio suggested a meeting and Nancy proposed it be in person with short presentations from each of the committees. Michael Link notes that project leadership may be involved and added that what the CRE committees do is directly related to the work at Nielsen. Lynda suggested a meeting with about 10 people. In the alternative, a webinar if more people were to be included. Michael Link noted Insights to Practice meetings occur after a webinar in which a study is presented to large numbers. He went on to say that, Insights to Practice are nuts and bolts dialogue that this is what the study found and this is how it affects Nielsen and this is what Nielsen is going to do about it. Lynda thought it was important for Nancy's team to be working with Nielsen's Local product team, which covers television and audio.

Michael Link notes that the earlier meeting looked at issues of diary non-response, which would have been difficult for Nielsen to do on its own. Lynda remarked that it is important that senior management at Nielsen hear what CRE has to say.

Nancy Gallagher said it may important to do some research on children and Paul Donato mentioned that Nielsen is forming a kids research group.

Lynda again suggested a follow-up meeting with Nielsen's local measurement, product leadership, and MSci team.

Nancy requested that any committees who are going to be completing research within the next three months let her know.

Janice suggested that the term practice include how the data are analyzed and Nancy said she would be happy to talk about that.

Education Committee

Jed Meyer was not in attendance but had relayed a request to Richard Zackon to remind members of selecting schools that they would be willing to reach out to; Alma Maters, Local Schools, etc. Lynda Clarizio said it would be helpful to have something in writing to share with the schools. George Ivie said mentioned that the MRC Board put forth that education is something his group needs to work on more intensely. Lynda said that Nielsen is a member of the partnership of New York City which has as one of their goals to make New York the Big Data Capital of the World. There are some programs coming up. Pat Liguori commented that it would be helpful for Wall Street to be better prepared to analyze Nielsen data. Richard invited CRE members or members of their staff to join the education committee.

Organization of Research

First, Richard spoke to distribution of CRE membership by Industry sector, Advertiser (1), Agency (6), National Broadcast (5), Local Broadcast (9), Cable (6), Syndication (2), Digital (2), Nielsen (2), Other (2) There are 40 seats overall. One question is how many seats for audio. It is up to the council how we fill the remaining seats. Digital and Advertiser are low. Stacey Shulman questioned what the by-laws say and Richard replied they just give a total number of 40. Nancy Gallagher commented that media companies now typically have multiple cross media divisions. Ceril Shagrin noted that individual council members work for cross media divisions and she expressed concern about a council with more than 40 members because meetings would become more difficult. Nancy noted that currently there is a cap at two seats per corporate client. A suggestion was made to look at the distribution of committee members by industry sector. Emily mentioned that Nielsen Consumer 360 would be a good place to get

the word out about CRE. Lynda Clarizio said it would be great at Consumer 360 to talk about the work of the CRE. Nancy Gallagher volunteered to work with the communications committee regarding Nielsen Consumer 360. The membership focus would be audio, digital, and advertisers. Lynda said she could be particularly helpful with Digital.

Pat Liguori said we currently have a limit of two seats per company and questioned whether that should be expanded. Stacey Shulman questioned what constitutes a signal company: ABC/ESPN ? ,IPG/Magna Global? Janice Finkel-Greene expressed concern about the many divisions of Magna Global and IPG and how those seats are allocated within the organization. Ceril raised the issue of standing committees verses projects and suggested that committees have sunset provisions and go on hiatus after a project is complete. Stacey Shulman noted there are several projects on her committee and asked what the change would be from going from committees to projects. Ceril noted people need to be active on a committee because the bylaws require committee membership. It was suggested that maybe the word active needs to go into the bylaws: you need to be on an active committee. Pat suggested that people submit their ideas to her to be discussed on the steering committee.

In a final comment, Lynda Clarizio mentioned a recent lapse in professional ethics in TV research in India. Nielsen came out clean but it shows the importance of ethics in research excellence.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:33 p.m.